

## *Saṅgārava Sutta – The Discourse to Saṅgārava*

"*Saṅgārava Sutta*" appears altogether seven times in the ancient strata of Pāli scriptures. However, the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *Majjhima Nikāya* 100 has no duplicate of the same name, although there is a complementary version in *Saṃyutta Nikāya*. The brahmin Saṅgārava in the *Majjhima Nikāya sutta* seems to be different from all those mentioned in the other discourses. See below in brief what the other *Saṅgārava Suttas* are about and where exactly they occur.

*SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta* – ven. Ānanda sees a brahmin, (Comy.: a friend from ven. Ānanda's lay life), as the brahmin enthusiastically practices ablution (purification of sins by water). Ven. Ānanda then asks the Buddha to teach Dhamma for his friend, upon which the Buddha approaches the brahmin, recites a verse of Dhamma about the benefits of virtue, and the brahmin then vows to be the Buddha's lay follower for life.

*SN 5.2.6.5. Saṅgārava Sutta* & *AN 5.4.5.3. Saṅgārava Sutta* – The brahmin Saṅgārava's background is not explained either in the *SN* or in the *AN* version, but it is possible that it is the same brahmin Saṅgārava as in the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *SN*, i.e. *SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta*. The brahmin asks the Buddha why some memorized texts are sometimes easily remembered even when difficult, and why are some text soon forgotten even if they seemed to be easy to remember. The Buddha explains that it depends on the presence of the five hindrances in the mind (i.e. sensual desire, ill will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and anxiety, and doubt).

*AN 3.2.1.10. Saṅgārava Sutta* – Brahmin Saṅgārava approaches the Buddha with the idea that those who practice sacrifice and enjoin others to practice sacrifice benefit many living beings, whereas anyone who becomes an ascetic benefit only themselves. The Buddha then explains that He Himself benefits many hundreds of thousands by teaching the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life. Ven. Ānanda then asks the brahmin which of the two (sacrificing or ascetic life) seems simpler and less harmful, and the brahmin refuses to answer. The Buddha then explains to the brahmin the three psychic powers ((1) self-multiplication, element transformation, (2) telepathy, and (3) teaching virtuous life) and acknowledges that He and many of His disciples have attained them. The brahmin then becomes the Buddha's lay follower for life. The brahmin Saṅgārava, according to the Pāli Commentary, was a superintendent of construction (building) repairs in the city of Rājagaha.

*AN 10.3.2.5. Saṅgārava Sutta* – The text here doesn't provide us with any further information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. The brahmin approaches the Buddha and asks him what is "near shore" and "far shore". The Buddha then explains that the eight factors of the Eight-Fold Noble Path if practiced wrongly they are the "near shore", and if they are practiced correctly, they are the "far shore". (Here "far shore" means the transcending of all suffering and rebirth, attainment of ultimate Enlightenment.) The discourse ends with eulogy of the Enlightened beings.

*AN 10.4.2.3. Saṅgārava Sutta* – The text here also doesn't provide any information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. It seems to be a different version of the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* in *AN 10.3.2.5*. The brahmin here also asks what is "near shore" and "far shore", and the Buddha answers that the "near shore" is breaking the five precepts (i.e. killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, false speech, and drinking alcohol), and the "far shore" is following the five precepts (i.e. not killing, not stealing, no sexual misconduct, no false speech, no drinking alcohol). The discourse finishes with the same eulogic verses as the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *AN 10.3.2.5*.

A complementary version of the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* appears in *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta*, which describes how the husband of the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached the Buddha with the intention to accuse Him of a mistake, whereas the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* describes how the youngest brother of her husband, brahmin Saṅgārava, questioned the Buddha's wisdom. After their attempts to test the Buddha, both of them asked to be accepted and ordained as the Buddha's monastic disciples, as monks, and soon after that became Arahants. Large part of the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta* is supplementary to the introduction of the *Saṅgārava Sutta*, hence that part is included in this translation, inserted at the end of the introductory part.

# The Translation of Saṅgārava Sutta and the Related Commentaries

## Introductory Part

<i>MN 100. Saṅgārava Sutta</i>	MN 100. The Discourse to Saṅgārava
473. <i>Evaṃ me sutam – ekaṃ samayaṃ bhagavā kosalesu cārikaṃ carati mahatā bhikkhusaṅghena saddhiṃ.</i>	473. Thus was heard by me – on one occasion the Exalted One journeys on a journey in (the kingdom of) Kosala, together with a Community of monks.
<i>Tena kho pana samayena dhanañjānī<sup>1</sup> nāma brāhmaṇī cañcalikappe<sup>2</sup> [maṇḍalakappe (sī.), paccalakappe (syā. kaṃ.), caṇḍalakappe (pī.)] paṭivasati abhippasannā buddhe ca dhamme ca saṅghe ca.</i>	At that time, indeed, the brahmin woman named Dhanañjānī <sup>3</sup> dwelled in Cañcalikappa, devoted to the Buddha, the Dhamma, <sup>4</sup> and the Saṅgha <sup>5</sup> as well.

<i>MNA 100. Saṅgāravasuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary to MN 100. Discourse to Saṅgārava
473. <i>Evaṃ me sutanti saṅgāravasuttam.</i>	473. "Thus was heard by me" means the Discourse to Saṅgārava.
<i>Tattha cañcalikappeti evaṃnāmake gāme.</i>	There "Cañcalikappe" means in a village of that name.
<i>Abhippasannāti aveccappasādasena pasannā.</i>	"Devoted" means she had unshakeable faith (in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha.)
<i>Sā kira sotāpannā ariyasāvika bhāradvājagottassa brāhmaṇassa bhariyā.</i>	She, indeed, (was) a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple, (and) the wife of the brahmin of Bhāradvāja clan.
<i>So brāhmaṇo pubbe kālena kālam brāhmaṇe nimantetvā tesam sakkāram karoti.</i>	That brahmin (would) previously every now and then invite brahmins (home) and treat them (by meal).
<i>Imaṃ pana brāhmaṇiṃ gharam ānetvā abhirūpāya mahākulāya brāhmaṇiyā cittaṃ kopetuṃ asakkonto brāhmaṇānam sakkāram kātuṃ nāsakki.</i>	However, after (the brahmin) brought this brahmin woman home (i.e. married her), (the brahmin) was unable to turn the mind of the beautiful brahmin lady of a powerful family (from thoughts about the Buddha), and (therefore) was unable to treat the brahmins (as before). <sup>6</sup>
<i>Atha naṃ brāhmaṇā diṭṭhadiṭṭhaṭṭhāne – "nayidāni tvaṃ brāhmaṇaladdhiko, ekāhampi brāhmaṇānam sakkāram na karosī"ti nippīlenti.</i>	Then, whenever the brahmins would see him, (they) pestered (him) : "now you are not a brahmin of gain, you don't treat brahmins even a single day."
<i>So gharam āgantvā brāhmaṇiyā tamattham ārocetvā – "sace, bhoti ekadivasaṃ mukhaṃ rakkhituṃ</i>	He came home, told about that issue to the brahmin woman, and said: "if (you), lady, manage to guard

<sup>1</sup> In Sinhalese and PTS versions there is "*dhānañjānī*" (Dhānañjānī).

<sup>2</sup> In Sinhalese version there is "*maṇḍalakappe*" (in Maṇḍalakappa), in Thai and Cambodian "*paccalakappe*" (in Paccalakappa), and in PTS version there is "*caṇḍalakappe*" (in Caṇḍalakappa).

<sup>3</sup> The brahmin lady Dhanañjānī, as we learn from the Commentaries, was a Stream-Enterer (*Sotāpanna*), hence she had unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha. She was the wife of a brahmin who was from Bhāradvāja clan.

<sup>4</sup> i.e. the Buddha's Teachings.

<sup>5</sup> i.e. the Community of the Buddha's monastic disciples: monks and nuns.

<sup>6</sup> I.e. the brahmin lady was so faithful to the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha, that it seemed impossible to persuade her to cooperate in invitation of non-Buddhist brahmins.

<i>sakkuṇeyyāsi, brāhmaṇānaṃ ekadivasam bhikkhaṃ dadeyya</i> "nti āha.	(your) mouth, one day (I) might make a donation for brahmins."
<i>Tuyhaṃ deyyadhammaṃ rucanakaṭṭhāne dehi, kiṃ mayhaṃ etthāti.</i>	"Give your donation wherever it pleases (you). What (shall) I do there?" <sup>7</sup>

<i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī upakkhalitvā tikkhattuṃ udānaṃ udānesi</i> –	Then, indeed, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī stumbled and exclaimed an exclamation three times:
<i>"namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa"ti.</i>	"I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world)."

<i>So brāhmaṇe nimantetvā appodakaṃ pāyāsaṃ pacāpetvā gharañca sujjhāpetvā āsanāni paññāpetvā brāhmaṇe nisīdāpesi.</i>	He (i.e. the brahmin) invited brahmins, asked (his wife <sup>8</sup> ) to cook milk-rice of little water, to clean the house as well, and after (he) asked (his wife) to prepare seats, (he) asked the brahmins to sit (there).
<i>Brāhmaṇī mahāsāṭakaṃ nivāsetvā kaṭacchuṃ gahetvā parivisanti dussakaṇṇake pakkhalitvā</i>	The brahmin woman took on a large garment, took a ladle, and as (she) served (the brahmins), (she) stumbled over a corner of the cloth (of her garment), <sup>9</sup>
<i>"brāhmaṇe parivisāmi"ti saññāmpi akatvā</i>	And not keeping in mind (the thought) "I am serving the brahmins",
<i>āsevanavasena sahasā satthārameva anussaritvā udānaṃ udānesi.</i>	And because of the habit, (she) hurriedly remembered the Master and exclaimed the exclamation.

<i>Tena kho pana samayena saṅgāravo nāma māṇavo cañcalikappe paṭivasati tiṇṇaṃ vedānaṃ pāragū sanighaṇḍukeṭubhānaṃ sākkharappabhedānaṃ</i>	Indeed, at that time the young man named Saṅgārava dwelled in Cañcalikappa, accomplished in (1) the Three Vedas, (2) vocabulary, (3) literary composition, (4) grammar, and (5) history as the fifth (lore); <sup>10</sup> chanter,
--	---

<sup>7</sup> According to the Sub-Commentary, the brahmin woman – being a Stream-Enterer – was free from the blemish of envy, hence she could be supportive of both the Buddha and the brahmins.

<sup>8</sup> From the later mention in this Commentary to the *Saṅgārava Sutta (MNA 100)* - "*ettakaṃ te khīrañca taṇḍulādāni ca nāsītāni*"<sup>ti</sup> = "now ("this much") is your milk and rice in vain" - it seems that it was the wife of the brahmin, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī, who cooked the milk-rice. According to the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta (SNA 1.7.1.1.)* it however seems that the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī didn't cook anything – "*Tayā aññaṃ kiñci kātabbaṃ natthi, sabbaṃ pacanaparivesanaṃ aññe karissanti.*" = "There is no other duty to be done by you, other (people) will do all the cooking and serving."

<sup>9</sup> Note here that according to this Commentary the brahmin woman stumbled over a corner of her garment, whereas according to the Commentary of *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhānañjānīsutta*, the brahmin woman stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.

<sup>10</sup> The five lores of ancient brahmins were, paraphrasing from the English translation made by the Burmese (in "*Majjhima Nikāya - Medium Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhimaṇṇāsa Pāli*", by U Htin Fatt, Department for

*itihāsapāñcamānaṃ, padako, veyyākaraṇo,  
lokāyatamahāpurisalakkhaṇesu anavayo.*

grammarian, erudite in the heretic philosophies<sup>11</sup> and  
the marks of a Great Man.

the Promotion and Propagation of the Sāsana, Yangon, 2008; p.586, PDF p.601) namely - (1) *vedattaya* (Three Vedas), (2) *nighaṇḍu* (vocabulary), (3) *keṭubha* (literary composition), (4) *akkharappabheda* (grammar), and (5) *itihāsa* (history).

Bhikkhu Bodhi however accepts Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli's translation (in *"The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya"*, Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2009; p.819) as "Three Vedas, with their vocabularies, liturgy, phonology, and etymology, and the histories as the fifth". The most detailed explanation of the five lores is found in *Vinayapiṭaka Tīkā – Vimativinodanī – Bāhiraṇidānakathā - Tatiyaśāṅgītikathāvaṇṇana* (MM vol.1 p.26). The correct understanding of the Pāli grammar is explained thus:

1. The five lores are understood including the Three Vedas, *not* as separate from them: "*tayo vedā, tesu itihāsapāñcomesu*" – "the Three Vedas, by them (it is) with history as the fifth." The Three Vedas are the first lore of the five, they are not superordinate to the other four (or five in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation).

2. *Keṭubha* is literary composition, *not* liturgy. "Liturgy" (according to OED on CD-ROM, Oxford University Press, 2009) is "A form of public worship, esp. in the Christian Church; a collection of formularies for the conduct of Divine service.". The Pāli-Burmese dictionary explains that *keṭubha* is the book of poems (ကဗျာဖွဲ့ဝုံးကျမ်း၊ အလင်္ကာကျမ်း); and the *kiriāyākkappavikappa* which characterizes the poems is "the composition of poems related to actions of wise men" (ပညာရှိတို့၏ အမှုအရာဟု ဆိုအပ်သော ကဗျာဖွဲ့ခြင်း အစီအရင်း). The explanation of *Vimativinodanī Tīkā* goes: "*Keṭubhanti kiṭati gameti kiriāyādivibhāganti keṭubhaṃ, kiriāyākkappavikappo kavīnaṃ upakārasatthaṃ. Ettha ca kiriāyākkappavikappoti vacībhedādīlakkaṇā kiriāyā kappiyāti vikappiyāti etenāti kiriāyākkappo, so pana vaṇṇapadabandhapadattādivibhāgato bahuvikappoti "kiriāyākkappavikappo"ti vuccati. Idañca mūlakiriāyākkappaganthaṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ.*" = "*Keṭubha*" means "the analysis of actions such as arriving (*kiṭati*) (and) going (*gameti*) (of wise men), (hence it is called) *keṭubha*. The thinking and considering the actions (of wise men) is the art instrumental in poetry. Also, there "thinking and considering the actions" (*kiriāyākkappavikappa*) means that by the work on distinctive characteristics of speech etc. there is thinking (and) considering, hence (it is called) "thinking (about) actions" (*kiriāyākkappavikappa*). It is in fact called "thinking and considering the actions" (because) of deep (/ "much") pondering over (poetic) elaboration(s) of connecting syllables (and) words (into verses), the meaning of the words, etc. It is also said in connection to the *Mūlakiriāyākkappagantha* (The Original Book of Ways of Action)." -> Therefore, "liturgy" is not a plausible translation. Correct translation is "literary/poetic composition", or (as we can see in U Htin Fatt's translation) "the art of writing".

3. "*Akkharappabheda*" is to be understood as one word (grammar/"distinction of syllables"), *not* as two words (*akkhara* - phonology and *pabheda* - etymology). Again, according to *Vimativinodanī Tīkā* – "*Thānakaraṇādivibhāgato ca nibbācanavibhāgato ca akkharaṇā pabhediyaṇti etenāti akkharappabhedo, sikkhā ca nirutti ca.*" = "The syllables are divided/sorted by the analysis of the origin place of the sound (*thāna*), the tongue area where the sound is pronounced (*karaṇa*) etc., as well as by the analysis of the definition (of the syllables), hence (it is called) "distinction (/ "dividing" / "sorting") of syllables", (both) the training (of it), as well as the application (/ "utterance"). Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of *akkharappabheda* as "phonology, and etymology" is ultimately correct, but in the context it should not be taken as two brahmanic lores; it is one lore only.

-- Note that the interpretation of Sub-Commentaries is essential for *Theravāda* tradition of Buddhists and especially monks, because it helps to prevent unnecessary misunderstandings. For example, due to the ignorance of Sub-Commentaries the Sinhalese monks few centuries ago had a bitter argument regarding ordination validity, a problem which would never occur in Myanmar. In Myanmar the great masters easily resolved the Sinhalese dispute by providing the Sinhalese monks with a number of quotes from Sub-Commentaries. It is the knowledge of Sub-Commentaries which helped the Burmese to be the most brilliant Buddhist meditators and scholars in the world.

<sup>11</sup> Bhikkhu Bodhi translates *lokāyata* as "natural philosophy". Natural philosophy of course is included in the Buddha's teachings as well, if we understand it as "the philosophy of nature". Therefore such translation makes no sense in the context. The Burmese interpretation says that it is the teachings of other philosophers and religious leaders of that time (တိထိတို့၏ ကျမ်း, in *Tipiṭaka Pāli-Burmese Dictionary*, vol.18, p.297).

<i>Assosi kho saṅgāravo māṇavo dhanañjāniyā brāhmaṇiyā evaṃ vācaṃ bhāsamānāya.</i>	Then, the young man Saṅgārava heard that utterance (i.e. the exclamation) told by the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī.
<i>Sutvā dhanañjāniṃ brāhmaṇiṃ etadavoca – "avabhūtāva ayaṃ<sup>12</sup> dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, parabhūtāva<sup>13</sup> ayaṃ dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, vijjamānānaṃ tevijjānaṃ<sup>14</sup> brāhmaṇānaṃ, atha ca pana tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇakassa vaṇṇaṃ bhāssati"<sup>15</sup>.</i>	After (the young man) heard (it), (he) told the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī this: "This brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just retarded, this brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just ruined for the knowledgeable brahmins of three proficiencies (/ "knowledges"), <sup>16</sup> because (she) speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic.
<i>"Na hi pana tvaṃ, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato sīlapaññānaṃ jānāsi.</i>	"You, however, dear beautiful-faced one <sup>17</sup> , don't know the virtue and wisdom of that Exalted One.
<i>Sace tvaṃ, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato sīlapaññānaṃ jāneyyāsi, na tvaṃ, tāta bhadramukha, taṃ bhagavantam akkositabbaṃ paribhāsitabbaṃ maññeyyāsi"<sup>18</sup>.</i>	If you, dear beautiful-faced one, knew the virtue and wisdom of the Exalted One, you, dear beautiful-faced one, would not think of blaming (or) censuring the Exalted One.
<i>"Tena hi, bhoti, yadā samaṇo gotamo cañcalikappaṃ anuppatto hoti atha me āroceyyāsi"<sup>19</sup>.</i>	"Well then, lady, (you) should inform me when (/ "that day") the ascetic Gotama arrives in Cañcalikappa.
<i>"Evaṃ, bhadramukhā"<sup>20</sup>ti kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī saṅgāravassa māṇavassa paccassosi.</i>	"Yes <sup>18</sup> , beautiful-faced one" then replied the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī to the young man Saṅgārava.

<i>Brāhmaṇā udānaṃ sutvā "ubhatopakkhiko esa samaṇassa gotamassa sahāyo, nāssa deyyadhammaṃ gaṇhissāmā"<sup>21</sup>ti kupitā bhojanāni chaḍḍetvā nikkhamiṃsu.</i>	The brahmins heard the exclamation, (and saying) : "(serving) both sides, (this brahmin is a) friend of that ascetic Gotama, we won't take donation from him," (the brahmins) were angry, threw away the food, and left.
--	--

<sup>12</sup> Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: *"avabhūtā cayaṃ"* ("this (brahmin woman) is also retarded").

<sup>13</sup> Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: *"parabhūtā cayaṃ"* ("this (brahmin woman) is also ruined").

<sup>14</sup> The word *"tevijjānaṃ"* ("of three powers/knowledges") does not appear in the Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS version.

<sup>15</sup> Sinhalese, Thai, Kambodian, and PTS versions: *"bhāssati"*.

<sup>16</sup> *Tevijjānaṃ* - of three knowledges, of three proficiencies. This word is also used for Buddhist monks, but unlike in brahmins, where the three knowledges mean the Three *Vedas*, in the case of Buddhist monks "Three Knowledges" are the psychic power of remembering their past lives, the vision of other beings born in different worlds according to their *kamma*, and the full comprehension of Four Noble Truths, i.e. complete eradication of all mental defilements. The word *vijjā* therefore may mean "knowledge", "psychic power", and "wisdom" as well. I therefore suggest "proficiency" as the word that could carry all the three meanings.

<sup>17</sup> Bhikkhu Bodhi doesn't translate this word, keeping only "sir". According to *SVA – 1.3.1.7. Aḍḍakaraṇasuttavaṇṇanā – "Bhadramukhoti sundaramukho."* = *"bhadra mukha"* means 'beautiful face/mouth'." Pāli-Burmese dictionary (vol.15, p.524) says: "(၁) ကောင်းသော မျက်နှာ၊ (၂) ကောင်းသော မျက်နှာ ရှိသောသူ" = "(1) good face; (2) person who has good face."

<sup>18</sup> "Yes", according to the Oxford English Dictionary, stands "for the affirmative sentence corresponding to the interrogative one constituting the question: = 'It is so.' The Pāli word *"evaṃ"* usually means "thus" or "so", hence I suppose "yes" is a translation most direct and comprehensible as well.

<i>Brāhmaṇo</i> <sup>19</sup> – "nanu paṭhamameva taṃ avacaṃ 'ajjekadivasaṃ mukhaṃ rakkheyyāsi'ti, ettakaṃ te khīraṇca taṇḍulādīni ca nāsītāni'ti	The brahmin (husband said) : "didn't (I) tell you already in the beginning, 'today you should guard (your) mouth for one day', now (/ "this much") is your milk and rice in vain."
<i>atīviya kopavasasaṃ upagato</i> – "evameva paṇāyaṃ vasali yasmai vā tasmai vā tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇassa vaṇṇaṃ bhāsati, idāni tyāhaṃ vasali tassa satthuno vādaṃ āropessāmi'ti āha.	Getting extremely angry, (the brahmin then) said: "Thus, indeed, this scoundrel woman speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic (who lives) somewhere away. Now I will accuse your teacher of a mistake, scoundrel woman!"
<i>Atha naṃ brāhmaṇi</i> "gaccha tvaṃ, brāhmaṇa, gantvā vijānissasi'ti vatvā	Then the brahmin woman told him: "Go, you brahmin, when (you) have gone, you will learn,"
"Na khvāhaṃ taṃ, brāhmaṇa, passāmi sadevake loke samārake sabrahmake sassamaṇabrāhmaṇiyā pajāya sadevamanussāya, yo tassa bhagavato vādaṃ āropeyyā'tiādīmāha. <sup>20</sup>	Adding (/ "saying") : "indeed, brahmin, I don't see in the world with gods, higher gods, Brahmas, ascetics (and) brahmins, with those born of gods and men, who could (correctly) accuse that Exalted One of a mistake."
<i>So satthāraṃ upasaṅkamitvā</i> –	He (i.e. the brahmin woman's husband) approached the Teacher and asked (this) question:
"Kiṃsu chetvā sukhaṃ seti, kiṃsu chetvā na socati;	"What (should) be destroyed in order to have a pleasant sleep? What (should) be destroyed in order not to grieve?
<i>Kissassu ekadhammassa, vadhaṃ rocesi gotamā'ti. (saṃ. ni. 1.187) – Pañhaṃ pucchi.</i>	What would be that one thing, that (you) Gotama declare to be slain? ( <i>SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjāni Sutta</i> )
<i>Satthā āha</i> –	The Teacher said:
"Kodhaṃ chetvā sukhaṃ seti, kodhaṃ chetvā na socati;	"Having destroyed anger, (one) has a pleasant sleep. Having destroyed anger, (one) doesn't grieve.
<i>Kodhassa visamūlassa, madhuraggassa brāhmaṇa;</i>	Of the anger that has a poisoned root (and) sweet tip, brahmin,
<i>Vadhaṃ ariyā paṃsaṃsanti, tañhi chetvā na socati'ti. (saṃ. ni. 1.187) –</i>	Noble Ones praise the slaughter, if that is destroyed, (one) doesn't grieve." ( <i>SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjāni Sutta</i> )
<i>Pañhaṃ kathesi. So pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	(Thus the Buddha) answered (/ "spoke") the question. He (i.e. the brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahantship.
<i>Tasseva kaniṭṭhabhātā akkosakabhāradvājo nāma "bhātā me pabbajito'ti sutvā bhagavantaṃ upasaṅkamitvā akkositvā bhagavatā vinito pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	Even when his younger brother named <i>Akkosaka Bhāradvāja</i> (/ "the blaming Bhāradvāja") heard "my brother is ordained", (he) approached the Exalted One, blamed (Him), and admonished by the Exalted One he (the brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahantship.
<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho sundarikabhāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named Sundarika (i.e. "Beautiful") Bhāradvāja.
<i>Sopi bhagavantaṃ upasaṅkamitvā pañhaṃ pucchitvā vissajjanaṃ sutvā pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	He also approached the Exalted One, heard the answer, ordained (as a monk), and attained Arahantship.

<sup>19</sup> From here onward we learn the story-line of *Dhanañjāni Sutta*. Because this is a faithful rendering of the original, I believe it is sufficient for the present purposes.

<sup>20</sup> I have replaced the abbreviated version consisting of dots with the full version from *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjāni Sutta*.



<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho piṅgalabhāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named Piṅgala (i.e. "Tawny").
<i>So pañhaṃ pucchitvā pañhabyākaraṇapariyosāne pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	He asked (the Buddha) a question and at the end of the answer he ordained (as a monk) and attained Arahant hood.
<i>Saṅgāravo māṇavoti ayaṃ tesāṃ sabbakaniṭṭho tasmīṃ divase brāhmaṇehi saddhiṃ ekabhaddagge nisinno.</i>	"The young man Saṅgārava" means the youngest (brother) of them, (who) sat on that day (of Dhānañjāni's exclamation) together with (other) brahmins in one refectory.
<i>Avabhūtāvāti avadḍhibhūtā avamaṅgalabhūtāyeva.</i>	"Retarded" means without progress, simply subject to bad omens.
<i>Parabhūtāvāti vināsaṃ pattāyeva.</i>	"Ruined" means simply fallen into destruction.
<i>Vijjāmānānanti vijjāmānesu.</i>	"For the knowledgeable (brahmins)" means "in the knowledgeable (brahmins)".
<i>Sīlapaññānanti sīlañca ñāṇaṇca na jānāsi.</i>	"Virtue (and) wisdom" means you do not know (the Buddha's) virtue as well as (His) wisdom.

<i>SNA 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānisuttavaṇṇanā<sup>21</sup></i>	Commentary to SN 1.7.1.1. Discourse about Dhanañjāni <sup>22</sup>
<i>187. Brāhmaṇasaṃyuttassa paṭhame dhanañjānīti dhanañjānigottā.</i>	187. "Dhanañjāni" of the first (discourse) of Brāhmaṇa Saṃyutta means she is from the Dhanañjāni clan.
<i>Ukkaṭṭhagottā kiresā.</i>	Indeed, she is of an glorious clan.
<i>Sesabrāhmaṇā kira brahmuno mukhato jātā, dhanañjānigottā matthakaṃ bhinditvā nikkhantāti tesāṃ laddhi.</i>	Other brahmins are indeed born from the Brahmā's mouth, those of the Dhanañjāni clan came out from the (Brahma's) broken head, they believed. <sup>23</sup>
<i>Udānaṃ udānesīti kasmā udānesi?</i>	"Exclaimed an exclamation", why did (she) exclaim (it)?
<i>So kira brāhmaṇo micchādiṭṭhiko "buddho dhammo saṅgho"ti vutte kaṇṇe pidahati, thaddho khadirakhāṇusadiso.</i>	Indeed, that brahmin was of wrong view, covering (his) ears when (the brahmin woman) said "Buddha, Dhamma, Saṅgha", obdurate, like a stump of acacia tree.
<i>Brāhmaṇī pana sotāpannā ariyasāvika.</i>	The brahmin woman was, however, a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple.
<i>Brāhmaṇo dānaṃ dento pañcasatānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ appodakaṃ pāyāsaṃ deti, brāhmaṇī buddhappamukhassa saṅghassa nānārasabhojanaṃ.</i>	When the brahmin gave donation to the five hundred brahmins, he gives milk-rice with little water, (whereas) the meal of the brahmin woman (donated) to the

<sup>21</sup> This Commentary nicely illustrates the qualities of a lay woman as a Stream-Enterer, together with an issue that may arise when she lives with a non-Buddhist husband. I believe that the characteristics of a Stream-Enterer (esp. the unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha; complete devotion to them) possessed by a lay person will be clearly understood from this narrative.

<sup>22</sup> The translation has been done according its Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation in "*Thanyote Aṭṭhakathā Nisya*" (သံယုတ်အတ္ထကထာနိဿယ), vol.2, [author unknown], [publisher unknown], [year of publishing unknown]; pp.84-90.

<sup>23</sup> This is apparently a ridicule on the brahmins' conceited evolution history. Generally is believed (until today), that brahmins are born of the Brahma's mouth, whereas others are born of other bodily parts of Brahma. The name "Dhanañjāni" can be translated as "experiencing wealth".

	Community of monks headed by the Buddha (consists) of various tastes.
<i>Brāhmaṇassa dānadivase brāhmaṇī tassa vasavattitāya pahīnamaccheratāya ca sahatthā parivisati.</i>	On the day of the brahmin's donation the brahmin woman serves (the brahmins) by her hand due to (her) compliance to him (i.e. her husband) as well as due to (her) absence of envy.
<i>Brāhmaṇiyā pana dānadivase brāhmaṇo pātova gharā nikkhamitvā palāyati.</i>	However, on the day of the brahmin woman's donation (to the Buddha and Saṅgha) the brahmin (i.e. her husband) left from the home early in the morning and scampered away.
<i>Athekadivasaṃ brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇiyā saddhiṃ asammantetvā pañcasate brāhmaṇe nimantetvā brāhmaṇiṃ āha –</i>	Then on one day the brahmin, without consulting (that) with the brahmin woman, invited five hundred brahmins and told to the brahmin woman:
<i>"sve bhoti amhākaṃ ghare pañcasatā brāhmaṇā bhuñjissanti"ti.</i>	"Lady, tomorrow five hundred brahmins will eat in our house."
<i>Mayā kiṃ kātabbaṃ brāhmaṇāti?</i>	What should be done by me, brahmin? (Replied his wife.) <sup>24</sup>
<i>Tayā aññaṃ kiñci kātabbaṃ natthi, sabbaṃ pacanaparivesanaṃ aññe karissanti.</i>	There is no other duty to be done by you, other (people) will do all the cooking (and) serving.
<i>Yaṃ pana tvaṃ tthitāpi nisinnāpi khipitvāpi ukkāsitvāpi "namo buddhassa"ti tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇakassa namakkāraṃ karosi, taṃ sve ekadivasaṃ mattaṃ mā akāsi.</i>	However, how you, either standing or sitting, sneezing, (or) coughing pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic (saying) "I bow to the Buddha", don't do that tomorrow just for a single day.
<i>Taṃ hi sutvā brāhmaṇā anattamanā honti, mā maṃ brāhmaṇehi bhindasīti.</i>	Indeed, if the brahmins hear that, they will be displeased; don't destroy my (reputation) among the brahmins.
<i>Tvaṃ brāhmaṇehi vā bhijja devehi vā, ahaṃ pana satthāraṃ anussaritvā na sakkomi anamassamānā saṇṭhātunti.</i>	Your (reputation) shall be destroyed among brahmins, or among gods, I however can't stay remembering the Teacher and not paying respect (to Him).
<i>Bhoti kulasatike gāme gāmadvārampi tāva pidahituṃ vāyamanti, tvaṃ dvīhaṅgulehi pidahitabbaṃ mukhaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ bhojanakālamattaṃ pidahituṃ na sakkosīti.</i>	Lady, (people at night) can try to close the village door of the village (where live) hundred families, (however) you can't close a mouth that could be closed by two fingers (even) just during the time when brahmins eat.
<i>Evaṃ punappunaṃ kathetvāpi so nivāretuṃ asakkonto ussīsaṃ taphitaṃ maṇḍalaggakhaḃgaṃ gahetvā –</i>	Even though speaking thus again and again, he (i.e. the brahmin) was unable to conclude (the talk), (hence he) took the dagger of rounded tip kept above (his) head, (and threatened) :
<i>"bhoti sace sve brāhmaṇesu nisinnesu taṃ muṇḍasamaṇakaṃ namassasi,</i>	"Lady, if you pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic tomorrow while the brahmins are sitting,
<i>iminā taṃ khaggena pādatalato paṭṭhāya yāva kesamatthakā kaḷiraṃ viya koṭṭetvā rāsimaṃ karissāmi"ti imaṃ gāthaṃ abhāsi –</i>	I will chop (your body) from the soles of (your) feet until the hair of (your) head like a top sprout and make a pile (of it)." (Then) he pronounced this verse:

<sup>24</sup> The intention here is to show that unlike the brahmin husband, who couldn't stand even meeting with the Buddha and Saṅgha, the brahmin woman has no problem meeting with the brahmin's visitors, and is even open to serve them. It might be also interpreted to show the openness and support of Buddhists toward followers of other faiths.



<i>"Iminā maṇḍalaggena, pādato yāva matthakā; Kaḷīramiva chejjāmi, yadi micchaṃ<sup>25</sup> na kāhasi.</i>	"By this (dagger's) rounded tip, from feet until the head; I will slice (you) like a top sprout, if you don't do (according to) my will.
<i>"Sace buddhoti bhaṇasi, sace dhammoti bhāsasi; Sace saṅghoti kittesi, jīvantī me nivesane"ti.</i>	"If you say "Buddho", if you speak "Dhammo", If you praise "Saṅgho", alive in my dwelling place."
<i>Ariyasāvīkā pana pathavī viya duppakampā, sineru viya dupparivattiyā.</i>	The Noble Disciples, however, are difficult to shake like the earth, difficult to turn over like (the mountain) Sineru. <sup>26</sup>
<i>Sā tena naṃ evamāha –</i>	Then she spoke to him thus:
<i>"Sace me aṇḍamaṇḍāni, kāmaṃ chejjasi brāhmaṇa; Nevāhaṃ viramissāmi, buddhaseṭṭhassa sāsana.</i>	"If (you) brahmin willingly cut of my limbs, Even (then) I will not refrain from the Teaching of the Supreme Buddha.
<i>"Nāhaṃ okkā varadharā, sakkā rodhayitum jinā; Dhītāhaṃ buddhaseṭṭhassa, chinda vā maṃ vadhassu vā"ti.</i>	"I am not accomplished (or) carrying perfection, (I am) able to cry up to the Victor, I am a daughter of the Supreme Buddha, (whether you) cut me or slain me."
<i>Evaṃ dhanañjānigajitaṃ nāma gajjantī pañca gāthāsātāni abhāsi.</i>	Thus roaring the so called "roar of Dhanañjāni", (she) spoke five hundred verses (in this manner). <sup>27</sup>
<i>Brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇiṃ parāmasitum vā paharitum vā asakkonto "bhoti yaṃ te ruccati, taṃ karohi"ti vatvā khaggaṃ sayane khiṇi.</i>	The brahmin, unable to touch or hit the brahmin woman, said: "lady, do as you like," and threw the dagger on the bed.
<i>Punadvase geḥaṃ haritupalittaṃ kārāpetvā lājāpuṇṇaghaṭamālāgandhādīhi tattha tattha alaṅkārapetvā</i>	The next day (the brahmin) asked (the servants) to smear the house with cow dung <sup>28</sup> , adorned (the house) here and there with parched corn, pots filled with water, flowers, etc.,
<i>pañcannaṃ brāhmaṇasatānaṃ navasappisakkharamadhuyuttaṃ appodakapāyāsaṃ paṭiyādāpetvā kālaṃ ārocāpesi.</i>	requested (his servants) to prepare milk-rice of little water combined with new ghee, new molasses, (and) new honey, and informed (the brahmins) that the time (is right to eat).

<i>Brāhmaṇīpi pātova gandhodakena sayāṃ nhāyitvā sahassagghanakaṃ ahatavatthaṃ nivāsetvā</i>	The brahmin woman, indeed, early in the morning took bath herself in perfumed water, clothed a new garment worth thousand (pieces of money),
--	--

<sup>25</sup> I suppose *micchaṃ* is made of *me* + *icchaṃ*.

<sup>26</sup> Sineru (or also Meru) is a mythical mountain believed to be in the center of the flat-earth world system, as taught by Hindu cosmology. Unfortunately, although the Buddhist masters had the psychic powers of levitation and clair-voyance, in the Pāli scriptures there is no mention of the false perceptions of the Hindus, nor any mention that the "world" may seem to be spherical. All the concept of Hindu cosmology has been entirely accepted by the Buddhist scriptures. The mythical mountain of Sineru (or Meru) is there described being in the very center of the disk-like flat earth, measuring 84 000 *yojanas* (one *yojana* is equivalent to ca.15 km) above the surface of water, and 84 000 *yojanas* below the surface of water. The mountain Sineru (or Meru) is visible only by psychic powers.

<sup>27</sup> Unfortunately, I am not able to find any more verses of Dhanañjāni's roar throughout the available Pāli scriptures.

<sup>28</sup> In ancient India cow dung was used as disinfectant, both inside houses and on roads as well.

<i>pañcasatagghanakaṃ ekamsaṃ katvā sabbālaṅkārapaṭimaṇḍitā suvaṇṇakaṭacchum gahetvā</i>	Arranged ("made") (another garment) worth five-hundred (pieces of money) over one shoulder, adorned with all adornments (she) took a golden ladle,
<i>bhaddagge brāhmaṇe parivisaṃmānā tehi saddhiṃ ekapantiyaṃ nisinnassa tassa brāhmaṇassa bhaddaṃ upasaṃharanti dunnikkhitte dārubhaṇḍe pakkhali.</i>	And as she was serving the brahmins in the refectory, she was carrying rice for a brahmin who was sitting with them (i.e. the other brahmins) together in the same row, and stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.
<i>Pakkhalanaghaṭṭanāya dukkhā vedanā uppajji.</i>	Because of the crash (caused by) stumbling, unpleasant feelings arose.
<i>Tasmiṃ samaye dasabalaṃ sari.</i>	At that moment (she) remembered the One of Ten Powers <sup>29</sup> .
<i>Satisampannatāya pana pāyāsapātiṃ achaddetvā saṇikaṃ otāretvā bhūmiyaṃ saṇṭhapetvā</i>	However, because (she) was endowed with mindfulness, (she) didn't throw away the (golden) cup of milk-rice, putting (the cup) slowly down, and when (the cup) was well put on the ground,
<i>pañcannaṃ brāhmaṇasatānaṃ majjhe sirasi añjaliṃ ṭhapetvā yena veluvanaṃ, tenañjaliṃ paṇāmetvā imaṃ udānaṃ udānesi.</i>	In the midst of five hundred (non-Buddhist) brahmins, she placed (her erected) fingers on (her) head, directed (her) fingers where there was Bamboo Grove <sup>30</sup> , and exclaimed the exclamation.

<i>Tasmiṃca samaye tesu brāhmaṇesu keci bhuttā honti, keci bhuñjamānā, keci hatthe otāritamattā, kesañci bhojanaṃ purato ṭhapitamattaṃ hoti.</i>	Also, at that moment some of those brahmins have already eaten, some were (still) eating, some have just put their hand into (their alms-bowls), some had the meal just placed in front of them.
<i>Te taṃ saddaṃ sutvāva sinerumattena muggarena sīse pahaṭṭā viya kaṇṇesu sūlena viddhā viya dukkhadomanassaṃ paṭisaṃvediyamānā</i>	Having heard that sound (of the exclamation), they experienced suffering (and) grief as if they were struck by a club of the size of the (mountain) Sineru, (or) pierced into (their) ears by a skewer,
<i>"iminā aññaladdhikena mayaṃ gharaṃ pavesitā"ti kujjhitvā hatthe piṇḍaṃ chaddetvā mukhena gahitaṃ niṭṭhubhitvā</i>	And (saying) angrily: "We have entered a house of this man of different views" (they) threw the lump (of rice they had in their hand) from their hands, spat away what was in (their) mouths,

<sup>29</sup> *Dasabala*, also known as *Tathāgatabala* are ten powers of the Buddha, mentioned and explained in different text throughout the Pāli scriptures. The most famous list is included in *MN 12. Mahāsihanāda Sutta*. In brief, they are: (1) the understanding of what is possible and what is impossible, (2) understanding of the result of action, (3) understanding the ways leading to all destinations (rebirth), (4) understanding the world with its many and different elements, (5) understanding the different inclinations of beings, (6) understanding the disposition of the faculties of other beings, (7) understanding the path to the attainment of jhānas and Enlightenment, (8) knowledge of His past lives, (9) understanding and vision of beings passing through death and life according to their actions, and (10) the attainment of the taintless deliverance of mind and deliverance by wisdom. (Written with help of *Bhikkhu Bodhi's "The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhima Nikāya"*, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2005; p.165-166.)

<sup>30</sup> *Veluvana* (Bamboo Grove) is apparently the place near her dwelling place where the Buddha stayed most often.

<i>dhanuṃ disvā kākā viya brāhmaṇaṃ akkosamānā disāvidisā pakkamiṃsu.</i>	Reviled the brahmin like a crow that saw a bow <sup>31</sup> and left in different directions.
<i>Brāhmaṇo evaṃ bhijjivā gacchante brāhmaṇe disvā brāhmaṇiṃ sīsato paṭṭhāya oloketvā,</i>	When the brahmin's (reputation) was thus destroyed, as (he) saw the brahmins going away, (he) looked at the brahmin lady from her head (down),
<i>"idameva bhayaṃ sampassamānā mayaṃ hiyyo paṭṭhāya bhotiṃ yācantā na labhimhā"ti nānappakārehi brāhmaṇiṃ akkositvā,</i>	And blaming the brahmin lady in different ways (starting) : "Exactly this danger (I) presumed since yesterday, and (although) requesting the lady (to obey), we didn't receive (her obedience),
<i>etaṃ "evamevaṃ panā"tiādivacanaṃ avoca.</i>	(He) said the words (of scolding) : "Thus indeed (this scoundrel)" etc.

<i>Upasaṅkamīti "samaṇo gotamo gāmaṇigamaratṭhapūjito, na sakkā gantvā yaṃ vā taṃ vā vatvā santajjetuṃ, ekameva naṃ pañhaṃ pucchissāmi"ti</i>	"Approached" means (thinking) : "the ascetic Gotama is revered by the village, town, (and) the country, it is not possible to go (there) and frighten (him) just by saying something; I will ask him just one question."
<i>gacchantova "kiṃsu chetvā"ti gāthaṃ abhisankharitvā –</i>	(And) already while going (he) made up the verse: "What (should) be destroyed (etc.)."
<i>'sace 'asukassa nāma vadhaṃ rocemi'ti vakkhati, atha naṃ 'ye tuyhaṃ na ruccanti, te māretukāmosi, lokavadhāya uppanno, kiṃ tuyhaṃ samaṇabhāvenā'ti? Niggahessāmi.</i>	If he says: "I teach slaughter of this particular (person)," then I will censure him (saying) : "you want to kill those that don't appreciate you, (you) are (here) in order to kill human, why would you be an ascetic?"
<i>Sace 'na kassaci vadhaṃ rocemi'ti vakkhati, atha naṃ 'tvaṃ rāgādīnampi vadhaṃ na icchasi. Kasmā samaṇo hutvā āhiṇḍasī'ti? Niggahessāmi.</i>	If he says: "I do not teach slaughter of anything," then I will censure him (saying) : "you don't wish to slaughter (your) lust, etc. Why are (you) then roaming about as an ascetic?"
<i>Iti imaṃ ubhatokoṭikaṃ pañhaṃ samaṇo gotamo neva gilītuṃ na uggilītuṃ sakkhissati'ti cintetvā upasaṅkami.</i>	And thinking: "Thus the ascetic Gotama will be able neither to swallow up nor vomit this two-edged (sword-like) question," (the brahmin) approached (the Buddha).

<i>Atha kho bhagavā kosalesu anupubbena cārikaṃ caramāno yena cañcalikappaṃ tadavasari.</i>	Then the Exalted One, journeying on a gradual journey in (the city of) Kosala and settled there where was Cañcalikappa.
<i>Tatra sudaṃ bhagavā cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane.</i>	There indeed, the Exalted One stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Assosi kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī – "bhagavā kira cañcalikappaṃ anupatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane"ti.</i>	Then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī heard: "Really, the Exalted One has arrived to Cañcalikappa, He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī yena saṅgāravo māṇavo tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā saṅgāravaṃ māṇavaṃ etadavoca –</i>	So, then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached where there was the young man Saṅgārava; (and)

<sup>31</sup> I suppose this reflects the experience of the writer – at that time crows were shot by arrows (from bows), hence the crows learned to be scared of bows. It seems that crows at that time would fiercely cry when they saw a bow.

	having approached (him) (she) told to the young man Saṅgārava:
<i>"ayaṃ, tāta bhadramukha, so bhagavā cañcalikappaṃ anuppatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane.</i>	"Now, dear beautiful-mouthed one, the Exalted One has arrived in Cañcalikappa, He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Yassadāni, tāta bhadramukha, kālaṃ maññasī"ti.</i>	Now (you), dear beautiful-mouthed one, know the time of it.

May all beings be happy and healthy ☺

monk Saraṇa